

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 114 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 02/11/2021

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NEW YORK

MEI KUM CHU, SAU KING CHUNG, and QUN XIANG LING, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

- against –

CHINESE-AMERICAN PLANNING COUNCIL HOME ATTENDANT PROGRAM, INC.,

Defendant.

Index No. 651947/2016

NOTICE OF APPEAL

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Defendant Chinese-American Planning Council Home Attendant Program, Inc. ("CPC"), by its undersigned attorneys, hereby appeals to the Appellate Division of the Supreme Court of the State of New York, First Judicial Department, from the Decision and Order on Motion of the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York, the Honorable Carol R. Edmead, J.S.C., dated February 9, 2021 ("Order"). Notice of entry was served on February 9, 2021. This appeal is taken from each and every part of the Order as well as from the whole thereof. A true and accurate copy of the Notice of Entry of dated February 9, 2021, and of the Order, is annexed hereto as Exhibit A.

Dated: New York, New York February 11, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

By: <u>/s/ Kenneth Kirschner</u> Kenneth Kirschner

David Baron Hogan Lovells US LLP 390 Madison Avenue

New York, New York 10017

Tel: 212-918-3260 Fax: 212-918-3100

Attorneys for Defendant CPC

1

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 114 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 02/11/2021

> TO: Michael Taubenfeld FISHER TAUBENFELD LLP 225 Broadway, Suite 1700 New York, New York 10007 Tel: (212) 571-0700

Fax: (212) 505-2001

michael@fishertaubenfeld.com

S. Tito Sinha TAKEROOT JUSTICE 123 William Street, 16th Floor New York, New York 10038 Tel: (212) 810-6744 Fax: (212) 619-0653 tsinha@takerootjustice.org

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 114 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 02/11/2021

Supreme Court of the State of New York Appellate Division: ludicial Department

Informational Statement (Pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1250.3 [a]) - Civil

Case Title: Set forth the title of the case as it appears on the summons, notice of petition or order to show cause by which the matter was or is to be commenced, or as amended. For Court of Original Instance						
·						
Mei Kum Chu, Sau King C	Mei Kum Chu, Sau King Chung, Qun Xiang Ling,					
against	Date Notice of Appeal Filed					
- against -						
Chinese-American Planning Council Home Attendant Program, Inc.,			For Appellate Division			
Defendant.						
Case Type		Filing Type				
71						
Civil Action	☐ CPLR article 78 Proceed	ing Appeal	☐ Transferred Proceeding			
☐ CPLR article 75 Arbitration	☐ Special Proceeding Oth	er Driginal Proceed	•			
	☐ Habeas Corpus Proceed		Executive Law § 298			
		Eminent Domain	☐ CPLR 5704 Review			
		☐ Labor Law 220 or 2 ☐ Public Officers Law				
		Real Property Tax	·			
Nature of Suit: Check up to three of the following categories which best reflect the nature of the case.						
☐ Administrative Review	☐ Business Relationships	☐ Commercial	■ Contracts			
☐ Declaratory Judgment	☐ Domestic Relations	☐ Election Law	☐ Estate Matters			
☐ Family Court	☐ Mortgage Foreclosure	☐ Miscellaneous	☐ Prisoner Discipline & Parole			
☐ Real Property	■ Statutory	☐ Taxation	□ Torts			
(other than foreclosure)						

Informational Statement - Civil

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 114 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 02/11/2021

	Appe	al				
Paper Appealed From (Check one only):	If an appeal has been taken from more than one order or				
		1	judgment by the filing of this notice of appeal, please			
			mation for each such order or			
		judgment appealed from	on a separate sheet of paper.			
☐ Amended Decree	☐ Determination	\square Order	☐ Resettled Order			
☐ Amended Judgement	☐ Finding	☐ Order & Judgment	\square Ruling			
☐ Amended Order	☐ Interlocutory Decree	☐ Partial Decree	Other (specify):			
☐ Decision	☐ Interlocutory Judgmen	t	Decision & Order on Motion			
☐ Decree	☐ Judgment	☐ Resettled Judgmen	t			
Court: Supreme Court		County: New	York 🔽			
Dated: 02/09/2021		Entered: 02/09/2021				
Judge (name in full): Hon. Carol R. Edme	ead	Index No.: 653250/2017				
Stage: ■ Interlocutory □ Final □	Post-Final	Trial: 🗌 Yes 🗏 No	If Yes: 🗌 Jury 🔲 Non-Jury			
	Prior Unperfected Appeal	and Related Case Informat	ion			
Are any appeals arising in the same act	tion or proceeding current	lv pending in the court?	■ Yes □ No			
If Yes, please set forth the Appellate D						
2020-04603	3	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •				
Where appropriate, indicate whether t	there is any related action	or proceeding now in any o	court of this or any other			
jurisdiction, and if so, the status of the	case:					
There is a related action in the So			Chinese-American Planning			
Council Home Attendant Progran	n, Inc., No. 15-cv-0960)5 (LGS).				
Original Proceeding						
Commenced by: Order to Show Cause Notice of Petition Writ of Habeas Corpus Date Filed:						
,						
Statute authorizing commencement of proceeding in the Appellate Division:						
Proceeding Transferred Pursuant to CPLR 7804(g)						
Court: Choose Court		ounty: Choo	se County			
Judge (name in full):		rder of Transfer Date:	<u></u>			
CPLR 5704 Review of Ex Parte Order:						
Court: Choose Court		ounty: Choo	se Countv			
Judge (name in full):		ated:	oo oodiitv			
		pplication and Statement c	of Issues			
· ·						
Description: If an appeal, briefly describe the paper appealed from. If the appeal is from an order, specify the relief						
requested and whether the motion was granted or denied. If an original proceeding commenced in this court or transferred						
pursuant to CPLR 7804(g), briefly describe the object of proceeding. If an application under CPLR 5704, briefly describe the						
nature of the ex parte order to be reviewed. Defendant/Appellant ("CPC") appeals a Decision and Order granting Plaintiff's application for leave to						
Defendant/Appellant ("CPC") appeals a Decision and Order granting Plaintiff's application for leave to reargue, granting restoration of this action (which was previously dismissed) to active status and granting						
leave for Plaintiffs to amend their complaint more than four years after Plaintiffs were on notice of the						
deficiency in their pleading.						
deliciency in their pleading.						

Informational Statement - Civil

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 114 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 02/11/2021

Issues: Specify the issues proposed to be raised on the appeal, proceeding, or application for CPLR 5704 review, the grounds for reversal, or modification to be advanced and the specific relief sought on appeal.

On appeal, CPC will argue that:

- 1. The Supreme Court erred in restoring this case to the active calendar because the reason it was stayed (and then dismissed) is the pendency of another overlapping litigation. That litigation is still pending, meaning that CPC will be forced to defend the same claims in two fora simultaneously.
- 2. The Supreme Court erred in permitting Plaintiffs to amend their complaint nearly five years after the action was first filed, and more than four years after Plaintiffs were first put on notice of the defect in their complaint that they now seek to cure.

Party Information

Instructions: Fill in the name of each party to the action or proceeding, one name per line. If this form is to be filed for an appeal, indicate the status of the party in the court of original instance and his, her, or its status in this court, if any. If this form is to be filed for a proceeding commenced in this court, fill in only the party's name and his, her, or its status in this court.

No.	Party Name	Original Status		Appellate Division Status
1	Mei Chu	Plaintiff	▼	Respondent
2	Sau Chung	Plaintiff		Respondent
3	Qun Ling	Plaintiff		Respondent
4	Chinese-American Planning Council Home Attendant Program, Inc.	Defendant		Appellant 🔽
5				
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				

Informational Statement - Civil

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 114 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 02/11/2021

Attorney Information						
Instructions: Fill in the names of the attorneys or firms for the respective parties. If this form is to be filed with the notice of petition or order to show cause by which a special proceeding is to be commenced in the Appellate Division, only the name of the attorney for the petitioner need be provided. In the event that a litigant represents herself or himself, the box marked "Pro Se" must be checked and the appropriate information for that litigant must be supplied in the spaces provided.						
Attorney/Firm Name: Michael Taubenfeld / Fisher Taubenfeld LLP						
Address: 225 Broadway, Suite 1700						
City: New York State: NY Zip	o: 10007 Telephone No: 212-571-0700					
E-mail Address: michael@fishertaubenfeld.com						
Attorney Type: ■ Retained □ Assigned □ Go	overnment 🗌 Pro Se 🔲 Pro Hac Vice					
Party or Parties Represented (set forth party number(s) from t	table above): Nos. 1, 2, 3					
Attorney/Firm Name: S. Tito Sinha / Takeroot Justice Address: 123 William Street, 16th Floor						
City: New York State: NY Zip	p:10038 Telephone No: 212-810-6744					
E-mail Address: tsinha@takerootjustice.org						
Attorney Type: ■ Retained □ Assigned □ Go	overnment 🗆 Pro Se 🗆 Pro Hac Vice					
Party or Parties Represented (set forth party number(s) from to	able above): Nos. 1, 2, 3					
Attorney/Firm Name: Kenneth Kirschner / Hogan Lovells US LLP	0.00 to					
Address: 390 Madison Avenue						
City: New York State: NY Zip	p:10017 Telephone No: 212-918-3000					
E-mail Address: kenneth.kirschner@hoganlovells.com						
Attorney Type: ■ Retained □ Assigned □ Go	overnment 🗆 Pro Se 🗆 Pro Hac Vice					
Party or Parties Represented (set forth party number(s) from to	able above): No. 4					
Attorney/Firm Name: David Baron / Hogan Lovells US LLP						
Address: 390 Madison Avenue						
City: New York State: NY Zip	o:10017 Telephone No: 212-918-3000					
E-mail Address: david.baron@hoganlovells.com						
Attorney Type: ■ Retained □ Assigned □ Go	overnment 🗌 Pro Se 🔲 Pro Hac Vice					
Party or Parties Represented (set forth party number(s) from table above): No. 4						
Attorney/Firm Name:						
Address:						
City: State: Zip	o: Telephone No:					
E-mail Address:						
Attorney Type: ☐ Retained ☐ Assigned ☐ Go	overnment 🗌 Pro Se 🔲 Pro Hac Vice					
Party or Parties Represented (set forth party number(s) from table above):						
Attorney/Firm Name:						
Address:						
City: State: Zip	o: Telephone No:					
E-mail Address:						
Attorney Type: ☐ Retained ☐ Assigned ☐ Go	overnment					

Informational Statement - Civil

Party or Parties Represented (set forth party number(s) from table above):